

Reservation - A Sin or A Blessing

 Jan 8, 2021  Constitution

 Aryan and Hrithik

 3 Minutes



RESERVATION - A SIN or A BLESSING

Introduction: -

Reservation, in the present times is a branch of the tree we all know as 'caste'. In recent times there's tons of hue and cry on reservation. The demand from the upward class of society (Upper Caste) is to get rid of reservation from both job sector and education system, whereas, the backward classes want to continue with an equivalent for eternity. The basic idea for bringing in reservation during independence was the discriminatory nature of people of India at that time.

India has only got out of the years old British rule over it and the mindset of people has changed during this period. There used to be a lot of discrimination among people of different castes. To manage this and to have equal representation of the suppressed caste or communities, the concept of reservation was brought forward.

Reservation's evolved with time and different schemes were implemented for the changing scenario. In layman terms, reservation is all about reserving a portion or percentage in number of seats in government jobs, educational institutions, etc. The primary reasoning for having reservation as stated by the institutor's was the advancement and adequate representation of the scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and other backward classes. This paved the way for hatred towards lower castes by the upward classes with a legitimate reason of getting benefit of their economic and qualified status within the society.

It was introduced as well as constitutionalized by Dr. B.R. Ambedkar to enhance the social strata of the backward people and to bring them at par with Upward class and was enunciated in article's 15 and 16. Reservation is often considered as a type of discrimination in a positive way and may be considered as an exception to article 15 which prohibits discrimination on different basis.

The truth is that, albeit we mention modern society or society of 21st century living in digital era, but the roots of the class structure are buried deep within us. This is more obviously seen during marriage. The so-called modern person (be it male or female) won't have an equivalent perspective about the opposite person if he/she belongs to a lower caste albeit the opposite person is well qualified or economically sound and has same modern principles. There are exceptions but majority of the today's generation remains hardwired to those old principles.

The term used to identify reservation is known as 'quota'. This practice is not limited to reservation only but also includes some other benefits like age relaxation, lower qualifying marks

in exams, fee relaxation, etc. 70 years have been passed since independence, but the greed and need for reservation is only increasing with time.

Today, remove the class structure from the society and let the classification be restricted to only Religion under which all are one and there'll be nothing called as reservation as everyone are going to be at par with others. This ground reality is hard to digest for anyone who pretend to be modern, but at the back of mind still adhere to old principles.

Reservation is provided to the needy people in various forms but some of the most familiar and controversial ones are mentioned below: -

1. Gender based reservation.
2. Caste based reservation.
3. Income based reservation.
4. Reservation for differently abled.

Gender based Reservation: -

Women's issue in India has gained prominence once more with the Unnao and Hyderabad rape tragedies. Challenging patriarchy comes with its own sets of problems and negative fallouts. Sociologists report that violence against women has been on the increase ever since they need started stepping out of their traditional roles as homemakers. The more women enter into public spaces, the more violence they're likely to face.

Violence against women may be a heinous manifestation of deep-seated prejudices against them which dictate that she must be confined to the domestic sphere. These prejudices still dominate our ethos once we note that India's female labour force participation rate has been dramatically falling, and has fallen to a historic low of 23.3% as per the NSSO.

The 2019 Lok Sabha lauded the very fact that India had its highest number of girls MPs within the Lok Sabha, which may be a mere 14%! this is often much below the already low global average of 24%. Moreover, in 1950 itself women formed 5% of Parliament. A mere 9% increase within the last 69 years is a sobering reminder of how slow the progress has been.

As per the Inter-Parliamentary Union report, India fares poorer than countries like Afghanistan (27.7%), Pakistan (20.6%) and Saudi Arabia (19.9%). States like Tripura, Nagaland, Arunachal Pradesh, Himachal Pradesh and therefore the former state of Jammu and Kashmir don't have one women MP within the Lok Sabha. In fact, Nagaland has never had a female MLA! This begets the questions, how is India failing its women so miserably and why don't we've reservation for ladies yet?

Before we kick-start the talk on why we must have women's reservation, we must understand why we don't. The Constituent Assembly originally comprised 389 members out of which only 15 were women. A study of the Constituent Assembly Debates enlightens us of the very fact that the difficulty of women's reservation was raised within the Assembly but was rejected for various reasons. Women's reservation may be a complex topic. While one-third reservation of girls in panchayats and concrete local bodies has led to a welcome spurt in female political participation and leadership, there also are instances of girls getting used as proxies by men to win elections in various states from Maharashtra to Bihar. The 108th Amendment Bill detailing female reservation wasn't without its own set of problems.

2014 was hailed because the year of 'womanifestos', with all major parties vying for 33% reservation for ladies in parliament and state assemblies. 2019 was no different. The BJP places it high on its list of priorities and yet, five and a half years after it's come to power, there has been

no mention of it. Mainstream civil society discourse also did not maintain a sustained demand for women's reservation.

Caste based Reservation: -

Caste based reservations are the most hyped and controversial issues among the people of India. Those who are getting it are happy and those who don't are unhappy. Caste based reservation draws a line between people of the same country where **brotherhood** is promoted at a national level. Dejectedly, this line of distinction is promoted by saying it a positive affirmative action .

SC, ST and OBC candidates are the primary ones who are given reservation under the caste category. They combined hold around 50% reservation quota in different sectors. Also, there is no rule of 'creamy layer' With regard to SC/ST reservations. It means that whether the candidate is financially or socially stable, still he will be getting reservation in the decided categories. The motive of reservation is to empower the reserved caste by ensuring that they are equally heard in the state and not left behind.

Income based Reservation: -

Reservation based on financial condition of people can be referred as progressive to some extent. This provide help to those who are in real need of it. Though it may have certain loopholes but it could be considered a better option against caste-based reservations.

10% of reservation is given to the economically weaker sections (EWS) particularly belonging to the upper castes. The requirement for individuals to fall under the 10% category will be such that their family income must be below Rs. 8 Lac per annum or having farmland less than 5 acres and residential house below 1000 square feet.

This quota for the economically poor people in the upper castes could be seen as a poverty alleviation move as the upper caste people are not discriminated to the extent at which SC/ST were.

Reservation for differently abled: -

The Constitution of India provides equal rights and opportunities to the disabled people with any quite disability of 40% or more (including blindness, visual defect, hearing disorder, locomotor disabilities, etc.), certified by doctors a bit like any ordinary people, who is fit n fine from all senses and [organs. so](#) as to attach disabled people with the mainstream of life, the Constitution of the country has made provision for reservation for them in government and government-run institution's jobs.

3 percent reservation of seats is provided by our Constitution under the Act of 1955 (Equal Opportunities, Rights Protection, and Full Participation) of the Constitution of India to facilitate normal life for such disabled or helpless persons. Following are the facilities provided -

1. 3 percent seats of state and government-funded educational institutions are reserved for the disabled.
2. Reservation in Government jobs.
3. Social security schemes.
4. Reservations in educational institutions.
5. Physically challenged people are given up to 10 years exempt in regulation in Government jobs. In case of all services associated with direct recruitment within the Central Government, 10 years aged relaxation for blind, deaf, physically handicapped or persons affected by spastic paralysis.

6. Extra 15 years exempt in regulation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribe people. Extra 13 years exempt in regulation for backward class.

For all government services, departments for direct recruitment to A, B, C and D posts, 3% of the seats are reserved for the disabled, out of which 1% of reservation is decided for every sort of disability. For reservations, the person with disability is required to verify 40% or more disability validated by doctor -

1. one-hundredth of reservation for blindness.
2. one-hundredth of reservation for hearing disorder.
3. one-hundredth of reservation for Locomotor Disability or spastic paralysis (Cerebral Palsy Victim).
4. If a post is suitable for a candidate with a kind of disability, then there's a provision for reservations for that post only to the candidate with an equivalent disability. In such a case, 3% reservation won't be deducted.

Apart from this, there's a provision for reservation in promotion for people with disabilities. Recently, the Supreme Court has decided that 3% reservation are going to be given to the disabled for promotion altogether the posts under the government of India. The court has passed this order after the order of the central government to implement the reservation for the disabled for Group C and Group D posts only. The court termed the Centre's order as illegal.

Our Views: -

I **Hrithik Rajat Kumar** believe that reservation is a sin in our country. Initially reservation was to be for 10 years after independence but due to highly political and controversial reasons and gathering vote it has destroyed our country's education and job system. I am grateful that Indian armed forces are not huge supporters of reservation. I think reservation is that venom which deprive one from his/her true potential.

Your perspective depends on whether you're taking advantage of this reservation system or losing from it. Hence, we've two sorts of emotions in India in respect of reservation. Most upper caste people think that reservation is bad because they're losing opportunities in getting education in good colleges and getting government jobs thanks to reservation. Most lower caste people (who get the advantage of reservation) feel that reservation isn't only justified but even necessary to get rid of the disparity between different castes in India. It is an incontrovertible fact that caste is a crucial element of Indian society.

Most couples in India belong to an equivalent caste. Hence, most of their relatives belong to an equivalent caste. They are all prejudiced on caste basis since their birth. Hence, whenever an opportunity rises, they promote the members of their own caste as compared to others. The lower caste people hardly had any representation in hierarchy of India before reservation. However, they're now well represented within the bureaucracy and politics. It is difficult to mention whether it's good or bad for India. If a policy benefits approximately 75% of the population (SC, ST, OBC), it is difficult to term it bad in a democracy.

It is role reversal now. In the earlier times, the upper castes (Brahmins, Rajput's and Vaisya) who were in power reserved most privileges for them. The same is done today by the lower castes. thanks to the intervention of the Honourable Supreme Court by placing cap of 50% in reservation, it would have crossed more than 75% by now. Interestingly, it has still not allowed reservation in Higher Judiciary. It is better to simply accept the truth of reservation system and live within the system instead of trying to prove its benefits or losses to India. Any amount of argument is not going to change the system, which is going to decide the issue on the basis of the votes.

I **Aryan Tomar** is of the view that 'reservation' is neither a sin nor a blessing. It is merely a tool for the upliftment of the scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and any socially and educationally backward classes of citizens who are not adequately represented in the society. But, overtime this concept has changed drastically and has taken a turn towards 'politics' aka **caste-based politics**. The whole political system of India is standing on the foot stone of caste. As long as caste politics exist, there will be no end to reservation.

Reservation is also a big hindrance in the growth and development of the country as the worthy were left off and those who have reservation were taken. This not only decreases the morale of candidates but also the quality of work in the reserved sector. Article 15 of the Constitution of India clearly states that reservation must be provided to socially and educationally backward classes but this system has turned wholly to a caste-based reservation system. The world class is being identified as caste by the reservation policy creators. Though I'm not saying that reservations must be completely abolished but it should be provided to those who are in real need of it. It could be provided on a merit-based system accompanied by financial position of the candidate and his family who sought reservation. Financial aid could also be provided to the under privileged.

In identification of socially and educationally backward classes, economic backwardness could not be ignored. The concept of economically weaker section must also be brought in the case of SC, ST or OBC reservations. This will keep a check on the elite class within these backward castes who are misappropriating this concept for several years. Also, high ranking officials or professionals with high income must not be provided with this benefit.

The policy of divide and rule used by the Britisher's upon us is now being used in the field of politics to secure the maximum vote bank. Though, many politicians will say that there exists no relation between politics and caste but deep down in our will we all know the harsh reality which cannot be ignored for too long. A solution soon enough must be devised to end this game of the political rulers.

Caste discrimination which is considered as a factor for reservation is not really relevant in today's picture. Instead, discrimination is now moving to **class based** i.e., rich and poor. People tend to discriminate more on the basis of other's financial status irrespective of caste. So there arise a much need for income and merit-based reservations. The age-old caste-based reservation system is proving to be a failure with respect to passage of time.

As regarding gender-based reservations, I think that it is right to some extent as it is a clear fact that women are still considered inferior to men in several parts of our nation. But if we take a clear look in our surroundings in the real world then it is also a clear fact that women are standing on the same level as men in most categories.

Just have a look at the examination grades in your school/college and you will find out that most of the students with the highest marks are female. Women have a greater presence of mind than men, they score higher, they are having all the advantages then still why are they looked upon and provided with reservations? The answer to this is the age-old mind-set that '**she's just a woman, what can she do?**' The day this thinking is erased from the minds of men as well as women themselves, I can definitely say that woman will surpass men and will rise high in all fields of life.

The real need for gender reservation arises in the case of transgender's. They are in real need of it as they face many injustices like harassment, severe discrimination, violence, etc. They not only need reservation but also other policies which will subsequently benefit in their upliftment.

To eradicate all these issues, we as the younger generation must actively take part in media, politics and law-making structure of the country. Otherwise, the phrase "**united we stand**,

divided we fall" would become a reality soon if all these situations tend to continue, which would consequently lead to the downfall of our nation.

- Aryan Tomar and Hrithik Rajat Kumar¹

¹ The authors are 3rd year law students of BBA LL.B.(Hons.) at Faculty of Law, Manav Rachna University, Faridabad.

JOIN OUR MAILING LIST

Enter Email



CONTACT US

Toll Free No: 1-800-103-3550
+91-120-4014524
contact@manupatra.com

FOLLOW US



Copyright © 2026 Manupatra. All rights reserved.